

Town of Enfield Wind Farm Advisory Committee Meeting –
March 22, 2016 - Enfield Community Building

1

PRESENT: Councilperson Mike Carpenter, Martha Fischer, Marcus Gingerich, Jude Lemke, Mimi Mehaffey, Councilperson Michael Miles, Julie Schroeder

ABSENT: Rob Tesori

OTHER IN ATTENDANCE (Audience): Councilperson Henry Hansteen

Michael Miles called the meeting to order at 7:00 p.m. and lead the assemblage in the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.

Approval of Minutes (3-15-16)

Corrections to March 15, Wind Advisory Committee Minutes

Page 1 change Coke to Koch

Page 3 4th paragraph There was discussion regarding Rick James responding to Peter Bardaglio statements of being certified by the INCE as an acoustical engineer and not being a non-biased scientist. March 8 WFAC Minutes included the answer to the above statements. Mimi Mehaffey asked to have the biographical statement for Rick James added to the Minutes.

Rick is the Principal Consultant for E-Coustic Solutions, of Okemos, Michigan (www.inceusa.org). Mr. James is a Noise Control Engineer with over 35 years of experience in addressing Community Noise for post and pre-build manufacturing facilities among other areas of interest. In this capacity he has worked with companies including: General Motors, Ford, Goodyear Tire and Rubber Company, Anheuser Busch, and Deere and Company as well as many smaller firms to address community noise issues either for existing plants where neighbor's complaints have led to governmental actions against the firms or in the early stages of Site Planning for new facilities to determine the compatibility of the proposed facility and the existing neighborhood. Mr. James has conducted studies throughout the U.S. and Europe for his clients. In addition to his business interests in applying the principles of noise control and measurement to his client's problems he is an Adjunct to Michigan State University's Department of Communicative Sciences and Disorders and, until recently, a voting member of the American National Standards Institute's S12 Committee which oversees Acoustical Test procedures used to standardize the work of acousticians and noise control engineers for measuring sound and assessing Land-Use-Compatibility in the U.S.

-
Page 6 Change Art Godwin to Art Godin.

Motion was made to approve the March 15 minutes as corrected. Motion passed to approve minutes unanimously.

Old Business

Michael Miles reminded everyone of the windadvisory@townofenfield.org e-mail to send articles/research/comments/suggestions to and the <https://trello.com/enfieldwindfarmadvisorycommittee> site for research articles, laws, and minutes of the Committee.

Michael Miles reminded the audience to keep all comments until the end of the meeting during the Privilege of the Floor. He reminded everyone that questions should be directed to the whole Committee and not personal attacks on individuals.

Update on Technical Experts

Michael Miles is compiling a set of questions to submit to the acoustic engineer of GE. He is using the list used to question Rick James and others have submitted questions to Michael Miles. He will send the compiled questions to Bob Frick. The Committee will not be having a phone conversation with the engineer but will leave it open for additional questions after the Committee receives answers to the questions.

Peter Bardaglio is working on arrangements for a trip on April 2 to Marsh Hill Wind Farm, Steuben County.

There was discussion if Marsh Hill Wind Farm would be a good representative of wind turbines compared to the turbines from Black Oak Wind Farm. It was suggested that perhaps Hardscrabble Wind Farm in Herkimer County might be a better alternative when comparing wind turbines.

Update on Proposal for Town of Enfield Wind Farm Advisory Committee

Michael Miles reported that he had not heard from BOWF regarding clarification on “setbacks”. He will let the Committee know when he receives an answer.

Update on Supplemental Draft EIS

There were no updates regarding the Draft Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement (DSEIS) BOWF. There has been a Special Town Board meeting scheduled for April 6. The Agenda for the meeting is to discuss Committee reports regarding BOWF and DSEIS.

There was discussion regarding the public comment period on the DSEIS. The comment period goes to April 12. There was a consensus that the Committee would like to see the comment period extended to 30 days. Michael Miles reported that Ann Rider, Town Supervisor, was requested to ask the town lawyers if they could extend the time. The Committee asked Michael Miles to follow through with the request both to Ann and the Lawyers. They would like to request an extension to April 30.

Mike Carpenter discussed his concerns about the process of the Committee moving forward towards its recommendations for the BOWF. He is working on possible resolution disputes to the mitigation process for the BOWF. It is based on the BOWF moving forwarding and placing the wind turbines in Enfield. He feels that the process will move forward that the BOWF will place the wind turbines in Enfield. He spoke about the many different levels of anxiety that could be created from the wind turbines. He said that high percentage of the people he had spoken to regarding the wind turbines had already made up their minds on how safe the wind turbines are. He stated he wanted the residents who are affected by the wind farm to have some sort of “escape clause” in case there are problems and they feel they cannot live in the area.

Other members of the Committee referred to anxiety and depression regarding the wind turbines. It is felt by some members that the wind farm should move forward to address the future of energy use and environmental impacts.

The question was asked what the Met Tower is used for and if it is to help regulate the speed and pitch of the blades? It was suggested that BOWF be asked these questions.

Anne Koreman, member of the BOWF, introduced herself from the audience. She agreed to take the above question to the BOWF.

Jude Lemke agreed to ask the “neighbors” of the BOWF how they felt about an “escape clause – property buy out”. She will report back to the Committee.

There was discussion regarding the BOWF having enough money to include a “buy out” program. There has been a lot of “discussion” within the community on this topic and a lot said “out of context”. It was stated that the only way to find out if there could be a “buy out” program was to ask BOWF.

Michael Miles suggested that perhaps a mediation session could still occur between BOWF and the “neighbors”.

New Business

Replacement Committee Member

Michael Miles reported that Peter Bardaglio has stepped down from his membership on the Committee. The Committee decided to recommend to the Town Board, Julie Schroeder as a full member of the Committee. They felt it was not necessary to ask for another alternate because of the time constraints of the Committee.

The Committee decided they will still need to look at the wind energy law but does not have to meet weekly for this process.

Jude Lemke stated she feels that the wind energy law needs to be amended to address some current issues.

Mike Carpenter said they legally can put restrictions in the Finding Statement. Trying to change the wind energy law at this point can cause more problems. It was pointed out that some people feel these restrictions are not enforceable.

Committee Group Report Updates

Committee members reported working with their groups on the DSEIS and wind turbines. No one was ready to share a report with the Committee yet.

Michael Miles asked if the Committee reports should have a common format. It was suggested each report should have an executive summary for each topic.

Privilege of the Floor

Beverly Gingerich – 101 Rumsey Hill Road - Appreciates the good intentions the Committee has done. She asked how people were notified to become investors in the BOWF. Audience members responded: heard through friends; community meetings. Anne Koreman from BOWF explained the process of starting investors and risks investors took. There was no direct mailing to residents of the town. The investment

opportunities were announced at town meetings. Beverly reported she had spoken with a resident living near a wind farm in Michigan. This resident had reported having medical problems and moving out of their home, as did their neighbors.

Cyrus Umrigar - 165 Caroline Depot Road – Stated he was involved in the fight against gas drilling. He feels every energy source has problems with different impacts. He feels the wind turbines will bring a lot of benefits to the community. He doesn't want to see a lot of law suits and wants to make it beneficial to all the community.

Henry Hansteen - South Van Dorn Road – Wondered how profitable the wind farms are he read that profits are made within a year. Audience answered no profits are not made within a year.

Sarah Hess – West Hill, Ithaca - Said she had friends all over concerned with the wind turbines and wants to reinforce a positive force with everything regarding the wind farm.

Brad Connors – Bostwick Road – Stated he was disturbed that the community seems to be pulled apart regarding the wind farm. He stated many risks that people have been through regarding various “new” projects, such as asbestos. He is not against the wind farm but not convinced there are enough safe guards in place. He doesn't want to see the wind farm become a burden to tax payers.

Anne Koreman – BOWF – Anne Koreman asked if Peter Bardaglio had provided a list of concessions which the BOWF has already been involved in. The Committee answered no they had not received a list. Anne Koreman said she will provide a list.

Martha Fisher asked how many Committee members wanted to visit Marsh Hill on April 2. It was suggested to call Peter Bardaglio to postpone the visit. Michael Miles will talk with Peter and ask about the Hardscrabble Wind Farm.

Michael Miles adjourned the meeting at 9:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted, Sue Thompson, Recording Secretary